



Meeting Date: November 19, 2024

AGENDA MEMORANDUM

To: Honorable Mayor and Members of Town Council

Through: David L. Corliss, Town Manager

From: Tara Vargish, PE, Director Development Services
Brad Boland, AICP Long Range Project Manager
Development Services

Title: 104 North Lewis Street Appeal

S ½ Lot 5 & All of Lot 6 Block 16 Craig & Gould's Addition to Castle Rock

Executive Summary

At the September 4, 2024 HP Meeting, the Historic Preservation Board approved with conditions a design review application for a single-family residence located at 104 North Lewis Street within the Craig & Gould Neighborhood. The conditions of approval directed the applicants to work with staff to modify the proposed siding materials to more closely match the Castle Rock Style guidelines.

Per Section 15.64.200.F of the Castle Rock Municipal Code an applicant may appeal the decision of the Historic Preservation Board to Town Council. The applicants, Susan and Steve Thayer, have submitted such an appeal. As such, Town Council shall hold a public meeting on the matter. The applicant and the public shall have reasonable opportunity to express their opinions on the application. Town Council shall consider the written findings and conclusions of the Board, whether the proposed new construction or alteration to a non-Landmarked property conforms to the review criteria, and shall approve, approve with conditions or modifications, or disapprove the application.



Background

Susan and Steve Thayer (the applicants) are the property owners of 104 North Lewis Street. The property is located at the north east corner of First Street and Lewis Street, within the Craig & Gould neighborhood, and is approximately 0.24 acres in size or 10,497 square feet.

History of Past Actions

On March 5, 2024 Town Council approved a demolition of the existing single-family residence on the property that was built in 1923. Town Council approval, after Historic Preservation review and recommendation, is required for proposed demolitions of structures built prior to 1945 in the Craig & Gould neighborhood.

At the September 4, 2024 Historic Preservation meeting, the Historic Preservation Board heard a design review application for a proposed single-family residence located at 104 North Lewis Street. Town staff recommended the approval of the application (see attached staff report for a detailed description of the project and analysis, Attachment A). Upon the Historic Preservation Board's review and deliberation, the Historic Preservation Board approved the application with conditions. The conditions of approval directed the applicants to work with staff to modify the proposed siding materials to more closely match the Castle Rock Style guidelines. The applicants proposed design incorporated 6-inch lap siding and gable ends ornamented with a vertical board and batten. The Historic Preservation Board discussed that the Castle Rock Style guideline document discouraged the use of 6-inch siding and encouraged the use of 4-inch siding. Castle Rock Style discouraged the use of the vertical board and batten as a siding material.

Per Section 15.64.200.F of the Castle Rock Municipal Code an applicant may appeal the decision of the Historic Preservation Board to Town Council. The applicants have submitted an appeal of the Historic Preservations Board decision to Town Council in accordance with the appeal requirements. Upon an appeal, Town Council shall hold a public meeting on the matter. The applicant and the public shall have reasonable opportunity to express their opinions on the application. Town Council shall consider the written findings and conclusions of the Board, whether the proposed new construction or Alteration to a non-Landmarked property conforms to the review criteria, and shall approve, approve with conditions or modifications, or disapprove the application.

Basis of Appeal

The applicants have researched other buildings in the Craig & Gould neighborhood, including some recent newer built structures that were approved by the Historic Preservation Board that include both 6 inch and 8 inch plank siding, and board and batten siding. The applicants believe their design does meet the intent of Castle Rock Style as "new construction may adopt **one or two** elements from local historic homes or buildings, such as gabled roofs, wood or brick construction, double-hung windows, or arched windows." They feel they have incorporated many elements from the guiding documents, and therefore the slight modification on the width of siding and using a small amount of board and baton siding should not be prohibited. The applicant's detailed appeal letter is Attachment B of this report. Town staff has confirmed that

previous Historic Preservation Board approvals on other properties did include those materials.

Design Review Regulations

The Design Review process applies to new construction, additions, and exterior modifications within the Craig and Gould neighborhood and is governed by Chapter 15.64.200 (Attachment C) of the Castle Rock Municipal Code. The purpose of the Design Review is to preserve the area's unique historic character. This neighborhood, the Town's oldest residential neighborhood, has distinctive architectural styles and community values that the Design Review process seeks to maintain while balancing growth and development.

Design Review applications shall be reviewed by the Historic Preservation Board for conformance with the F.R.E.S.H. standards in the Castle Rock Historic Preservation Plan (2007) and the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

The F.R.E.S.H philosophy (Attachment D) was developed by the staff of the Colorado Historical Society as a way to remember and explain the most basic components of proper infill design. F.R.E.S.H is an acronym meaning;

- F = Footprint
- R = Roof
- E = Envelope
- S = Skin
- H = Holes

The Standards for Rehabilitation are a set of guidelines developed by the U.S. Secretary of the Interior to help preserve and protect the historic character of properties while accommodating necessary repairs, alterations, and updates. These standards apply to any work on historic properties that involves preserving existing structures and are also used in designing infill (new construction in historic areas).

The Standards for Rehabilitation encourage infill projects to be compatible with the historic context but distinct enough to avoid creating a false sense of history. Infill design should avoid replicating historic styles exactly, instead drawing inspiration from characteristic design elements in a simplified, contemporary way. The Standards for Rehabilitation encourages infill projects to use materials that are compatible with, but not identical to, historic structures. For instance, if a neighborhood features primarily brick facades, an infill project might use brick but with a different treatment or pattern.

Guidance documents, such as Castle Rock Style (1996) and Castle Rock Design (2003), as amended from time to time, may be used as guidelines and aid in such review. If there is a conflict between Chapter 15.64.200 and the guidance documents, Chapter 15.64.200 shall control.

The Historic Preservation Board shall review the standards in a reasonable manner, taking into consideration economic and technical feasibility. The Historic Preservation Board may approve, approve with conditions, or deny the proposed new construction or Alteration. In the case of denial, the Board shall state the reasons in a written statement

and make recommendations in regard to the appropriateness of design, arrangement, texture, material and color.

Potential Motions

Motion to Grant the Appeal:

“I move that the applicants’ appeal be granted and their application approved without condition on the basis that: (1) applicants’ use of 6-inch lap siding and gable ends ornamented with a vertical board and batten in their design satisfies both the spirit and intent of the Castle Rock Style guidelines and is generally compatible with the existing character of the Craig & Gould neighborhood, and (2) the Board’s decision to approve the application upon the condition that applicants work with Town staff to modify their proposed siding materials failed to take into account the Board’s past decisions approving the use of the same or similar siding materials on new construction within the Craig & Gould neighborhood.”

Motion to Deny the Appeal:

“I move that the applicants’ appeal be denied and that the Board’s decision to approve the application with the condition that applicants work with Town staff to modify their proposed siding materials to more closely match the Castle Rock Style guidelines be upheld on the basis that: (1) the Board properly determined that the applicants’ use of 6-inch lap siding and gable ends ornamented with a vertical board and batten in their design is discouraged by the standards outlined in Castle Rock Style, and (2) the use of such materials is generally incompatible with the existing character of the Craig & Gould neighborhood.”

Continue item to next hearing (need more information to make decision)

“I move to continue this item to the meeting on xxxxx, 2025 to allow time for additional research regarding _____”

Attachments

- Attachment A: 104 North Lewis Street Design Review HP Staff Report
- Attachment B: Applicant Appeal Letter
- Attachment C: Castle Rock Municipal Code Chapter 15.64
- Attachment D: Development Standards from Historic Preservation Plan